COLLEGE OF CHARLESTON STATE LOTTERY PROGRAMS CHARLESTON, SOUTH CAROLINA

Independent Accountants' Report On Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures June 30, 2023

COLLEGE OF CHARLESTON STATE LOTTERY PROGRAMS

For the Year Ended June 30, 2023

Table of Contents

Independent Accountants' Report On Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures		
Reviewer's Findings	11	

MEMBERS AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF CPAS

PRIVATE COMPANIES PRACTICE SECTION

SOUTH CAROLINA ASSOCIATION OF CPAS

GOVERNMENTAL AUDIT QUALITY CENTER

CLINE BRANDT KOCHENOWER

& Co., P.A.

Certified Public Accountants

Established 1950

ALBERT B. CLINE, CPA (1923-2013)
RAYMOND H. BRANDT, CPA

Ben D. Kochenower, CPA, CICA, CGMA TIMOTHY S. BLAKE, CPA/PFS BRANDON A. BLAKE, CPA LAURA S. ARANGO, CPA JONATHAN CRUZ, CPA

Independent Accountants' Report On Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures

Dr. Andrew Hsu President, College of Charleston 66 George Street Charleston, SC 29424

Bryce Wilson, CPA Commission on Higher Education

We have performed the procedures enumerated below for the College of Charleston's State Lottery programs disbursed by the Commission on Higher Education (CHE) as of June 30, 2023. The College of Charleston's management is responsible for compliance with state requirements for the state lottery programs.

CHE has agreed to and acknowledges that the procedures performed below are appropriate to meet the intended purpose which is to assist CHE in evaluating whether the College of Charleston's state lottery programs are in compliance with state requirements. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of this report, may not meet the needs of all users of this report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes.

The procedures and associated findings are as follows:

We obtained the population of the state lottery programs disbursed by CHE from the College of Charleston to select a sample of students for each program. For the year ended June 30, 2023, the institution had disbursements to students in the following programs:

State Lottery Programs Disbursed by CHE	June 30, 2023	
Palmetto Fellow Scholarship	Yes	
Palmetto Fellow Scholarship Enhancement	Yes	
SC LIFE Scholarship	Yes	
SC LIFE Scholarship Enhancement	Yes	
SC Hope Scholarship	Yes	
SC National Guard College Assistance Program	Yes	
SC Need-Based Grant	Yes	
SC Need-Based Grant - Foster Care	Yes	

We obtained the student file for each student selected and performed procedures for eligibility requirements as prescribed in the four areas of: Initial eligibility and continued eligibility, records, retention, and award amount based on the specified laws, regulations, and contracts.

The result of those procedures are as follows:

		Exceptions
State Lottery Program Disbursed by CHE	Sample Size	Noted
Palmetto Fellow Scholarship	25	None noted
Palmetto Fellow Scholarship Enhancement	11	None noted
SC LIFE Scholarship	25	1
SC LIFE Scholarship Enhancement	7	None noted
SC Hope Scholarship	25	None noted
SC National Guard College Assistance Program	2	None noted
SC Need-Based Grant	25	None noted
SC Need-Based Grant - Foster Care	1	None noted

Palmetto Fellows Scholarship and Enhancement - 62-300 - 62-375

 We obtained and documented proof of SC residency and US Citizenship at the time of high school graduation and College enrollment and proof of South Carolina residency of the parent or guardian for dependent students.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained financial aid records and documented the signing of the required attestation affidavit for each academic year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained the institutional academic transcript and documented the initial enrollment date, initial eligibility date, student's academic classification, academic terms, credits earned and GPA.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We documented the student's enrollment status, credit hour enrollment, and if applicable, made note of any remedial and developmental courses taken to verify full time enrollment and that hours for AP, IB, Dual Enrollment, or CLEP are not used towards the credit hour requirements.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

6. We obtained the financial aid record and documented the Palmetto Fellows award amount to verify that the annual grant amount was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

7. We obtained the financial aid awarding and disbursing records to verify that the cost of attendance (COA) was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

8. We traced the disbursements to the student's account history from the business office.

Palmetto Fellows Scholarship and Enhancement - 62-300 - 62-375, Continued

9. We obtained the award notifications to determine if scholarship terms and conditions were provided.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

- 10. We obtained proof of the initial CHE approval. The approval from CHE signifies that the student satisfied the following criteria:
 - 3.5 SC UGP GPA (4.0 without ranking); and
 - 1200 SAT or 25 ACT (1400 SAT or 31 ACT without ranking); and
 - Top 6% rank in 10, 11, or 12 grade.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

11. We obtained the student account history and verified that the student did not receive LIFE scholarship, HOPE scholarship, or Lottery Tuition Assistance during the same award year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

12. We obtained evidence that the award term is within the maximum number of eligible terms.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

13. If the student did not retain their eligibility by the end of the spring term, we obtained the non-renewal notification. We verified that the notification included information regarding the student's ability to attend summer school in order to meet the continued eligibility requirements.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

Enhancement Only:

14. We obtained the student's program of study and traced the program to CHE's approved enhancement program listing.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

15. We obtained the academic transcript to verify that the student successfully completed at least 14 credits of STEM credit hours by the end of the student's first year of enrollment.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

16. We obtained and evaluated the academic transcript and documented the student's year of enrollment and number of awarding terms to not exceed 6 terms of usage.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

17. We obtained the academic transcript to verify that the student is in their 2nd, 3rd, or 4th year of full-time enrollment (based on the initial enrollment date).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

18. We obtained the student's financial aid award file to verify that total aid including the enhancement amount was not exceeded for the year.

SC LIFE Scholarship and Enhancement – 62-1200.1 – 62-1200.75

1. We obtained and documented proof of SC residency and US Citizenship at the time of high school graduation and College enrollment and proof of South Carolina residency of the parent or guardian for dependent students.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained financial aid records and documented the signing of the required attestation affidavit for each academic year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained the student's final high school transcript signed by the school official and documented the graduation date, SC UGPA, ACT/SAT score, and class ranking.

Finding: We found one exception. Our finding as a result of the procedure performed is presented on the Reviewer's Findings section of the report.

- 4. For transferring students, we obtained the academic transcripts to verify the following criteria:
 - Recipient earned a cumulative LIFE GPA of 3.0 or higher and
 - Recipient met the annual credit hour requirements based on the initial enrollment date:
 - o Second year transfer 30 non-remedial credit hours (or equivalent)
 - Third year transfer 60 credit hours (or equivalent)
 - o Fourth year transfer 90 credit hours (or equivalent)

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We obtained the FINAL official transcript and verified that the date calculated was between 3 days prior to the date of the high school graduation and no later than June 15th. Covid-19 waivers were taken into consideration, if applicable.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

- 6. We obtained and evaluated the institutional academic transcript and documented the initial enrollment date, initial eligibility date, student's academic classification, academic term, credits earned and LIFE GPA to verify that the student met the continued eligibility criteria:
 - Earned a cumulative Life GPA of 3.0 or higher by the end of the academic year.
 - Received the award in one of eight consecutive terms from the time of initial enrollment.
 - Met the annual credit hour requirement based on initial college enrollment date:
 - Second year 30 non-remedial credit hours (or equivalent)
 - o Third year 60 credit hours (or equivalent)
 - o Fourth year 90 credit hours (or equivalent)

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

7. We recalculated the student LIFE GPA and compared it to the institution's calculation.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

8. We obtained proof of full-time enrollment and documented any remedial or developmental courses taken.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

9. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

SC LIFE Scholarship and Enhancement – 62-1200.1 – 62-1200.75, Continued

10. We obtained the financial aid record and documented the LIFE award amount to verify that the annual grant amount was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

11. We obtained the financial aid awarding and disbursing records to verify that the cost of attendance (COA) was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

12. We traced the disbursements to the student's account history from the business office.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

13. We obtained and documented award notifications to determine if scholarship terms and conditions were provided.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

14. We obtained the student account history and verified that the student did not receive Palmetto Fellows scholarship, HOPE scholarship, or Lottery Tuition Assistance during the same award year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

Enhancement Only:

1. We obtained the student's program of study and traced the program to CHE's approved enhancement program listing.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained the academic transcript to verify that the student successfully completed at least 14 credits of STEM credit hours by the end of the student's first year of enrollment.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained and evaluated academic transcripts and documented the student's year of enrollment and number of awarding terms to not exceed 6 terms of eligibility.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We obtained the academic transcript to verify that the student is in their 2nd, 3rd, or 4th year of full-time enrollment (based on initial enrollment date).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We obtained the student's financial aid award file to verify that total aid including the enhancement amount was not exceeded for the year.

SC Hope Scholarship – *62-900.85 - 62-900.140*

1. We obtained and documented proof of the student's South Carolina residency and US Citizenship at the time of high school graduation and College enrollment and proof of SC residency of the parent or quardian for dependent students.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained financial aid records and documented the signing of the required attestation affidavit for each academic year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained the student's final high school transcript signed by the school official and documented the high school graduation date and verified that the SC UGP GPA was at least a 3.0.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We obtained the institutional academic transcript and documented the initial enrollment date, academic terms, and registered hours, excluding any remedial or developmental courses, to verify full-time enrollment and that the student is a first-time entering freshman who does not qualify for LIFE or Palmetto Fellows Scholarships.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We obtained the student account history to verify that the award amount did not exceed two thousand eight hundred dollars (includes \$300 book allowance) during the freshman year only.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

6. We obtained the student's financial aid file and documented the cost of attendance (COA) and all other gift aid to verify that COA was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

7. We obtained the award notifications to determine if scholarship terms and conditions were provided.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

8. We traced the disbursements to the student's account history from the business office.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

9. We obtained the student account history and verified that the student did not receive Palmetto Fellows scholarship, LIFE scholarship, or Lottery Tuition Assistance during the same award year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

10. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

11. We obtained evidence that the student was a Hope scholarship recipient for only 2 eligible terms.

SC National Guard College Assistance Program - 62-250 - 62-262

1. We obtained proof of student eligibility from CHE.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

- 2. We obtained the total lifetime award from CHE to ensure that the total lifetime maximum was not exceeded.
 - Army NG \$5,500 max per academic year
 - Air NG \$11,000 max per academic year (AIR National Guard recipients may receive up to a maximum of \$11,000 per academic year if enrolled in a two-year program at two-year or four-year eligible SC Institutions OR a maximum of \$5,500 at eligible SC four-year Institutions per academic year).
 - Lifetime max \$22,000

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained the student's institutional transcript to verify that the amount disbursed agreed to the student's enrollment status.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We obtained evidence that the student was making satisfactory academic progress as defined by the institution.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We obtained evidence that the student was enrolled in a degree-seeking program.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

6. We traced the disbursements to the student's account history from the business office and verified that ROTC scholarship funds were not disbursed to the student.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

7. We obtained the student's financial aid file and documented the cost of attendance (COA) and all other gift aid to verify that COA was not exceeded.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

8. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

SC Need-based Grant and Foster Care - 62-450 - 62-505

1. We obtained financial records and documented proof of US Citizenship, South Carolina residency, and in-state tuition qualification.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained financial aid records and documented the signing of the required attestation affidavit for each academic year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained proof that the student filed the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) and completed the process to determine eligibility for federal student aid each academic year.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We obtained the Institutional Student Information Record (ISIR) to verify that the student had not received a baccalaureate degree.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. We obtained evidence that the student was determined to be "needy" based on Title IV regulations for determining financial aid.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

6. We obtained evidence that the student was enrolled in a degree seeking program.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

7. We obtained evidence that the student enrolled and attended or had completed at the time of the grant disbursement in a minimum of six credit hours if part-time for the semester or twelve credit hours if full-time for the semester.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

8. For first-time applicants with previous credit hours, we obtained the credit hours and GPA to verify that the student earned at least a 2.0 cumulative GPA.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

- 9. We obtained the institutional transcript and the satisfactory academic progress evaluation to verify that the student maintained continued eligibility for the SC Need-based Grant, once enrolled as follows:
 - Completed a minimum of six credit hours if part-time for the semester or twelve credit hours if full-time for the semester.
 - Made satisfactory academic progress toward a degree as determined by the institution.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

10. We obtained the students' financial aid file to verify that maximum eligibility terms were not exceeded.

SC Need-based Grant and Foster Care - 62-450 - 62-505. Continued

- 11. We obtained the financial aid record to verify and document the following:
 - Award not to exceed the cost of attendance (Title IV methodology)
 - Award amounts not to exceed \$1,750 per eligible part-time student per academic year.
 - Award amounts not to exceed \$3,500 per eligible full-time student per academic year.
 - Award amounts not to exceed 50 percent of the annual award in any one term.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

12. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

Foster Care

1. We obtained evidence that the Institution gave priority and awarded the maximum allowable Needbased grant.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained the student's financial aid file including the student account history to verify that the Foster-Care grant amount did not exceed \$2,000 toward unmet need (\$1,000 per term if full-time, \$500 per term if part-time).

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

3. We obtained evidence that the student met the eligibility requirements under SC Need-based grant and submitted proper documentation.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

4. We obtained the "SC Need-based grant Waiver Form for Foster Care Youth" completed by the student's DSS representative.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

5. Obtained letter from the DSS representative indicating that the student is in custody of DSS or participating in Independent Living Services.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

6. We agreed the student's awarding documentation to the awarding information in CHE's AS400 (CHEMIS).

Other Procedures

1. We obtained the institution's current policies and procedures for monitoring lottery funded scholarships to ensure that the documents are readily available.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

2. We obtained and completed the CHEMIS variance analysis form with information provided by the institution and CHE to determine if the state lottery programs have been reconciled properly and in a timely manner.

We found no exceptions as a result of this procedure.

We were engaged by CHE to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with attestation standards established by the AICPA. We were not engaged to and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on State Lottery programs disbursed by CHE. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the College of Charleston and to meet our other ethical responsibilities, in accordance with relevant ethical requirements related to our agreed-upon procedures engagement.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of CHE and the College of Charleston and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than those specified parties.

November 1, 2024 Gaffnev. SC

Climo Brande Kochensur

Reviewer's Findings

LIFE Scholarship

Based on a sample of twenty-five (25) students

<u>Condition</u>: We found one instance where a student was awarded the SC LIFE Scholarship, but the student did not meet two of the three academic requirements for initial eligibility.

<u>Criteria</u>: 62-1200.10 (A-C) states, Students must meet two of the three criteria if a first-time freshman at an eligible four-year institution:

- 3.0 SC UGP GPA
- 1100 SAT or 22 ACT
- Ranked in top 30% of graduating class.

<u>Cause:</u> There was an oversight in the process of evaluating a student's initial LIFE Scholarship eligibility. The student earned at least a 3.0 SC UGP GPA; however, the student did not rank in the top 30% of their graduating class nor did they have test scores required available.

<u>Effect:</u> The institution incorrectly disbursed \$5,000 of SC LIFE Scholarship during the student's freshman year when the student was only eligible for the HOPE Scholarship. The institution must refund the LIFE Scholarship Program immediately by returning \$5,000 to the CHE due to an incorrect disbursement of LIFE funds during initial eligibility. The institution also should make the necessary and appropriate adjustment to award the student with the SC HOPE scholarship of \$2,800. Because the institution did not comply with the requirements of the regulations as stated above, the institution will be unable to collect \$2,800 for the HOPE Scholarship program.

Recommendation: We recommend the institution evaluate all functional areas that impact how and when initial eligibility is determined and identify weaknesses in current policies and procedures to reduce the risk of incorrect awarding and disbursing.

Management Response: It is acknowledged that this LIFE Scholarship was disbursed in error. Beginning with the 2023-2024 academic year, we refined an internal process that placed a hold on all student accounts that were potential state scholarship recipients without a final high school transcript on file as of August 1st. As the final high school transcripts were received, either the Assistant Director of Scholarships or the Associate Director for Scholarships reviews each student to ensure that scholarship eligibility is correct before disbursement occurs. In regard to this student, we will retract the LIFE Scholarship funds that were disbursed in error and replace it with the HOPE Scholarship. We will reimburse the SC CHE for the \$5,000 via the appropriate invoicing process at the conclusion of this audit. I understand that we cannot seek reimbursement of the HOPE Scholarship funds.